

SCOTTISH CRIMINAL CASES REVIEW COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD ON FRIDAY 31 OCTOBER 2025
10:00 AM, HYBRID MEETING (OFFICE & VIDEO CONFERENCE)
FOR DISCLOSURE VIA THE PUBLICATION SCHEME

In line with the Commission's Disclosure policy, various paragraphs may have been edited or deleted from these minutes as the information contained therein relates to specific case information and/or personnel-related matters. Where the summary of discussion has been edited or the names have been deleted, this is indicated at the start of the relevant paragraph or section.

Present:

Dr Vanessa Davies (Chair) – office
Ms Laura Reilly – office
Dr Alex Quinn – office
Ms Jacqueline Fordyce – office
Mrs Gillian Mawdsley – office
Mrs Suzie Mertes - office
Mr Finlay Young – office

Also Present:

Miss Frances McMenamin KC – office
Mr Michael Walker, Chief Executive - office
Mr Chris Reddick, Director of Corporate Services (minutes) – office
Mr Neil Rennick, Director General for Education & Justice, Scottish Government – office (from 1pm)

Section 1: Governance Matters (edited)

1.1 Apologies

Miss Forbes had submitted her apologies.

1.2 Conflicts of Interest/Declarations of Interest/Gifts & Hospitality

Members were asked to declare any known conflicts of interests or gifts and hospitality.

Ms Fordyce, Mr Young, Dr Quinn and Mrs Mertes each declared a conflict of interest in one stage 1 case respectively.

There were no conflicts of interest or gifts, and hospitality declared.

1.3 Minutes of Board meeting held on 26 September 2025

The Board approved the minutes of the Board meeting held on 26 September 2025, subject to minor amendment. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme, subject to minor amendment.

1.4 Matters Arising

There were no matters arising.

1.5 Minutes of Policy meeting on 19 September 2025

The Board approved the minutes of the Policy meeting held on 19 September 2025, subject to minor amendment. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme, subject to minor amendment.

1.6 Matters Arising

- 1.6.1 Mr Reddick noted that there had been a discussion at the Policy meeting regarding a rolling actions list on Board agendas. He confirmed that this would be taken forward on Boardbooks from November 2025.
- 1.6.2 Mr Walker noted that the process for staff conflicts had been discussed at the Policy meeting and confirmed that the policy applies equally to Members and staff and that any declared conflicts would therefore be minuted.
- 1.6.3 Mr Walker reported that the draft Homicide (Scotland) Bill, designed to implement the recent Scottish Law Commission recommendations on law reform, had been considered at the last Legal Officers' meeting. He confirmed that a response to this consultation had been considered but that he did not consider it appropriate for us to respond to this consultation. The Board agreed with this.

1.7 Chair's Report

- 1.7.1 Dr Davies thanked Mrs Mertes for chairing the September Board meeting. She also reported that she had attended part of the Franco-British Lawyers Society conference where Mr Walker had been giving a presentation. Although she wasn't there for the presentation, she reported that she had received very positive feedback on the talk from a number of attendees and wished to put her thanks to Mr Walker on record.
- 1.7.2 Dr Davies referred to the training provided by Dr Tunde Huszar at the Policy meeting on 19 September 2025, noting that this had been excellent and well received by all attendees. She widened the conversation out to cover CPD in general for Board Members and discussed additional matters that could be considered in future. Mrs Mawdsley noted that Miss Anderson undertakes an ongoing analysis of cases for legal officers and suggested that this could be extended to the Board for information.
- 1.7.3 Dr Davies also suggested that each Member of the Board should consider areas of future training, including contacts in their field of expertise who could be approached to deliver talks to the Board.

1.8 Chief Executive's Report

- 1.8.1 Mr Walker provided the Board with an update on the following matters:

- He reported that the Commission had been requested to participate in a resource budget planning exercise covering the period 2026-29, confirming that Mr Reddick has submitted a paper in line with the requested deadline. Mr Reddick provided

Members with an overview of the paper and the main assumptions used in its preparation.

- He reported that Mr Reddick had attended a Public Services Reform Summit on his behalf on 26 September 2025 and asked Mr Reddick to provide an overview. Mr Reddick summarised the main part of the agenda and confirmed that the focus was on driving forward the shared services initiative.
- He reported that he had given a talk at a National Symposium on Miscarriages of Justice in Canada via video link on 24 September 2025.
- He reported that he had received a request for a meeting with the CCRC's interim Chair, Dame Vera Baird, and that arrangements would be taken forward to facilitate this in due course, with Dr Davies also attending.
- He reported that a press enquiry had been received in respect of Post Office cases and provided Members with an overview.
- He reported that the Business Continuity Planning Team had met on 30 September 2025 and that this would be followed up by quarterly update meetings.

1.9 Court Decisions

Mr Walker referred Members to the opinion of the court issued on 9 October 2025, following the Commission's referral in the case of Shiva Mackison in May 2025, representing a successful outcome for the applicant. Dr Davies confirmed that this was an excellent result and noted the Board's thanks to Miss McNab for her work on this case.

1.10 Correspondence:

Mr Walker provided an overview of correspondence received from a previous applicant, a possible judicial review of the Commission's decision. After full discussion it was agreed that a response would be drafted and issued to the individual.

Section 2: Management Issues

2.1 Notification by Members of non-case related work

There was no non-case related work notified by Members.

2.2 Training & Development

Details of training and development that had been undertaken since the last meeting of the Board was provided.

2.3 Persistent & Repeated Applications and Persistent & Vexatious Correspondents Policies

Mr Walker confirmed that he had reviewed the comments on both these policies from the Policy meeting on 19 September 2025 and subsequently revisited these, providing some points of clarity and update within the policy documents. These were discussed in detail before being agreed by the Board. It was also agreed that the volume and level of input required in these cases would be monitored closely.

2.4 – 2.7 It was agreed to move the quarterly performance reports to the end of the agenda so that they could be considered in the presence of Mr Rennick.

Section 3: Case Matters (edited)

3.1 Monthly Case Summary:

Mr Reddick confirmed that a total of 19 new applications had been received in October 2025.

3.2-3.6 There were no cases in these categories.

3.7 Persistent & Repeated Applications: (Conflict: M Walker)

(Mr Walker left the meeting for the discussions in 3.7 as they related to decisions of his in line with the Persistent & Repeated Applications Policy.)

3.7.1 - 3.7.3 The Board noted that in respect of three individuals, their latest applications had been rejected in line with the Persistent & Repeated Applications Policy.

3.7.4 The Board noted that one individual had submitted an appeal of their registration on the Persistent & Repeated Applications Register. The Board reviewed Mr Walker's registration letter and the individual's subsequent appeal. After full discussion they agreed not to uphold the individual's appeal, agreeing with the grounds for registration detailed by Mr Walker.

3.8 Discussion Cases:

3.8.1 – 3.8.4 An issue which had arisen in one concluded application was discussed by the Board.

Section 4: Proposed Referral Cases

There were no cases in this category.

Section 5: Proposed Interim Cases (edited)

5.1 – 5.5 The Board considered five statements of reasons in this category. After full discussion it agreed not to refer any of the cases to the High Court.

Ms Reilly left the meeting in respect of one case having declared a conflict of interest and therefore took no part in the consideration of that case.

Section 6: Proposed Supplementary Cases

There were no cases in this category.

Section 7: Stage 1 Pre-acceptance Cases (edited)

7.1 – 7.22 A total of 22 new applications were considered and the following decisions were made:

1 case	Accepted for a review of conviction and sentence.
1 case	Accepted for a review sentence.
1 case	Rejected: it was not in the interests of justice to accept the case for review.
10 cases	Rejected: in each case the applicant had not appealed and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review.
5 cases	Rejected: in each case there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review.
1 case	Rejected: the applicant had abandoned their appeal and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review.
1 case	Rejected: the applicant's grounds were a repeat of their unsuccessful grounds of appeal and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review.
1 case	Rejected: the applicant had not appealed.
1 case	Continued for one month for more information.

Ms Fordyce, Mr Young, Dr Quinn and Mrs Mertes each left the meeting in respect of one case, having previously declared conflicts of interest, and therefore took no part in their consideration.

Section 2: Management Issues (Continued)

Dr Davies welcomed Mr Rennick to the non-case related part of the meeting at which point all attendees did a brief introduction. It was agreed that the quarterly performance reports would be considered along with some additional discussion points of mutual interest.

2.4-2.7 Mr Walker and Mr Reddick presented the following papers to the Board and Mr Rennick, which were subsequently discussed in full:

- 2.4 Quarterly Case Statistics Report – 30 September 2025
- 2.5 Quarterly Finance Report – 30 September 2025
- 2.6 Quarterly Summary Case Review Targets – 30 September 2025
- 2.7 Quarterly Business Plan Objectives Report – 30 September 2025

2.8 Discussion Points:

A number of other discussion points were also raised which included:

- The UK Supreme Court Appeals of Andrew Keir and David Daly, concerning the application of ss274 and 275 of the 1995 Act.
- Arrangements for forensic archive in Scotland.
- National Records of Scotland

These matters were discussed in full and a number of action points were agreed with Mr Rennick. Upon conclusion, Mr Rennick thanked the Board for its invitation and useful discussions, noting his ongoing thanks and support of the work of the Commission. On behalf of the Board, Dr Davies thanked Mr Rennick for attending.

Section 8: Concluding Matters

8.1 Any Other Competent Business

There was no other competent business.

8.2 Date of Next Meeting

- Board Meeting – Friday 28 November 2025 @ 10:00

C Reddick
14 November 2025