

SCOTTISH CRIMINAL CASES REVIEW COMMISSION

MINUTES OF THE POLICY MEETING ON FRIDAY 19 SEPTEMBER 2025
10:00, HYBRID MEETING

FOR DISCLOSURE VIA THE PUBLICATION SCHEME

In line with the Commission's Disclosure policy, various paragraphs may have been edited or deleted from these minutes as the information contained therein relates to specific case information and/or personnel-related matters. Where the summary of discussion has been edited or the names have been deleted, this is indicated at the start of the relevant paragraph or section.

Members Present:

Dr Vanessa Davies (Chair) – Office
Ms Laura Reilly - Office
Miss Alyson Forbes – Office
Mr Finlay Young – Office
Ms Jacqueline Fordyce – Office
Dr Alex Quinn – Office
Mrs Suzie Mertes - Office

Also Present:

Mr Daniel Fenn, Senior Legal Officer – Office (from section 2.0)
Ms Melissa McAlinden, Senior Administration Officer (minutes) – Office
Miss Frances McMenamin K.C., Consultant Legal Adviser – Office
Mrs Fiona Govan, Senior Legal Officer – Office (from section 2.0)
Miss Alison McNab, Legal Officer - Office (from section 2.0)
Miss Clare Marsh, Legal Officer – Office (from section 1.0)
Mr Matthew Bell, Legal Officer – Office (from section 1.0)

Section 1: Board Training – 10:00 – 11.30

1.1 Dr Tunde Huszar – Centre for Forensic Science, University of Strathclyde

Training Sessions – Novel Technologies for DNA Evidence in Court

Section 2: Governance Matters

2.1 Apologies

Mr Walker, Mr Reddick and Miss Mawdsley submitted their apologies.

2.2 Conflicts of Interest/Declarations of Interest/Gifts & Hospitality

Members were asked to declare any known conflicts of interests or gifts and hospitality.

There were no declarations of conflicts or hospitality.

2.3 Minutes of Policy meeting held on 21 March 2025

The minutes of the Policy meeting held on 21 March 2025 were approved by the Board. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme.

2.4 Matters Arising

It was noted that Sir Gerald Gordon has passed away, and that condolences have been given to his family. At the invitation of the Chair, Miss McMenamin K.C. offered a reflection on Sir Gerald's life and career.

2.5 Correspondence

It was noted that there is no expectations or actions required in relation to the circulated Diversity report for Boards.

Section 3: Policy Matters

3.1 Persistent & Repeated Applications Policy & Persistent & Vexatious Correspondents Policy (M Walker)

Mr Fenn provided Members with a brief overview of the Persistent & Repeated Applications Policy and the Persistent & Vexatious Correspondents Policy. Members discussed both policies in detail and agreed to bring them both back when Mr Walker is available for the discussions.

3.2 Health & Safety Policies (F Govan)

3.2.1 Mrs Govan provided an overview of the updated health and safety documents as follows:

- Note to the Board
- Health & Safety Policy
- Emergency Safety Policy
- Personal Safety Policy
- Road Risk Procedure

3.2.2 It was agreed it may be beneficial if the Audit Committee receive interim reports. Members agreed and approved all policy updates.

3.3 Information Governance Policies (S Lynn)

3.3.1 On Mr Lynn's behalf, Mr Fenn provided an overview of the updated information governance documents as follows:

- Note to the Board
- Data Protection Policy

- Privacy Notice
- Disclosure Policy
- Data Retention Policy

3.3.2 It was noted that the legal actions need to be added to period of retention. Members agreed it may be worthwhile adding in some wording to cover other potential inquiries such as the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry is mentioned. Members agreed and approved all policy updates.

3.4 Wellbeing & Trauma Support (A McNab & C Reddick)

3.4.1 Miss McNab provided an overview of the updated wellbeing & trauma support documents as follows:

- Note to the Board – Trauma-informed Practice & Support Update
- Note to the Board – Wellbeing Strategy
- Wellbeing Strategy
- Note to the Board – Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Policy
- CSR Policy

3.4.2 It was noted that the appendix has been updated to reflect that Miss McNab and Mr Lynn are the Mental Health first aiders. Members agreed and approved all policy updates.

3.5 Board Evaluation

- Note to the Board – Board Evaluation Exercise
- Board Evaluation Questionnaire

Members agreed on the questions. It was agreed that Mr Reddick can set a date for returning the questionnaire. It was also agreed that an editable PDF or word document should be circulated for completion. It was agreed that this should be completed before January.

Section 4: Position Papers

6.1 Position Papers (D Fenn)

6.1.1 Mr Fenn presented the following updated Position Paper.

- S274/275

6.1.2 Mr Fenn provided the Board with some background in relation to the development of the position paper. It was noted that there were some slight updates made and that there will be an interim update in due course, but it reflects the current position. Members agreed that the paper should be published now. It was noted that we are still awaiting a decision from the Supreme Court on the subject of the ECHR compatibility of ss274/275. Members were informed that the Victims Witnesses and Justice Reform (Scotland) Bill has been passed.

7.1 Any Other Competent Business

Members agreed that there should be an actions table added to the end of Board minutes to keep track of actions and when they are completed.

Melissa McAlinden
Senior Administration Officer

19 September 2025