

# SCOTTISH CRIMINAL CASES REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD ON FRIDAY 31 MAY 2024

### 10:00 AM, HYBRID MEETING (OFFICE & VIDEO CONFERENCE)

#### FOR DISCLOSURE VIA THE PUBLICATION SCHEME

In line with the Commission's Disclosure policy, various paragraphs may have been edited or deleted from these minutes as the information contained therein relates to specific case information and/or personnel-related matters. Where the summary of discussion has been edited or the names have been deleted, this is indicated at the start of the relevant paragraph or section.

#### **Present:**

Mr Bill Matthews (Chair) – video conference  
Mr Raymond McMenamin – video conference  
Mrs Elaine Noad – video conference  
Mrs Gillian Mawdsley – office  
Ms Laura Reilly – video conference  
Mrs Suzanne Mertes – video conference  
Mr Finlay Young – office  
Ms Jacqueline Fordyce – video conference

#### **Also Present:**

Mr Michael Walker, Chief Executive – office  
Mr Chris Reddick, Director of Corporate Services (minutes) – office  
Miss Frances McMenamin KC – video conference

### **Section 1: Governance Matters (edited)**

#### **1.1 Apologies**

Doctor Quinn had submitted his apologies.

#### **1.2 Conflicts of Interest/Declarations of Interest/Gifts & Hospitality (edited)**

Members were asked to declare any known conflicts of interests or gifts and hospitality.

Mr Matthews, Ms Fordyce and Mr Young all declared an interest in the same stage 1 case.

There were no declarations of gifts or hospitality.

#### **1.3 Minutes of Board meeting held on 26 April 2024**

The Board approved the minutes of the Board meeting held on 26 April 2024 subject to minor amendment. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme subject to the same minor amendments.

## **1.4 Matters Arising**

There were no matters arising.

## **1.5 Chair's Report**

Mr Matthews provided the Board with updates on the following matters:

- He advised Members that the Board recruitment process was well underway and work was being taken forward on producing the recruitment pack. He also set out the draft timetable which had been agreed.
- He reported that Board appraisals were almost complete and that he would draft notes of the remaining meetings in due course and circulate.

## **1.6 Chief Executive's Report**

1.6.1 Mr Walker reported that the Post Office (Horizon System) Offences (Scotland) Bill has completed all the parliamentary stages but that it is still to receive royal assent.

1.6.2 Mr Walker reported that he and Mr Reddick had attended a quarterly sponsor team meeting on 20 May 2024.

1.6.3 Mr Walker provided the Board with an update on the CCRC's proposed Closed Case Review exercise, as set out within an earlier press release of 14 April 2024, which was discussed by the Board.

1.6.4 Mr Walker confirmed that initial scoping work had been taken forward in respect of the proposed 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Seminar. Mr Reddick confirmed that he had now met with two events companies and was awaiting initial proposals and costings. He also reported that Thursday 28 November 2024 had been set for the date of the seminar and agreed to circulate this date.

## **1.7 Court Decisions**

There were no court decisions.

## **1.8 Correspondence:**

There was no correspondence for consideration.

# **Section 2: Management Issues**

## **2.1 Notification by Members of non-case related work**

Mr Matthews confirmed that he had undertaken work in respect of Board recruitment and appraisals during the month.

## **2.2 Training & Development**

The following training and development had been undertaken since the last meeting of the Board:

- Mr Lynn and Miss Anderson had undertaken risk assessment CPD on 9 May 2024.
- Miss Anderson had attended a LSA Victims, Witnesses and Justice Reform (Scotland) Bill Conference on 30 May 2024.

## 2.3 2024-25 Draft Business Plan (C Reddick)

Mr Reddick provided the Board with an overview of the draft 2024-25 Business Plan, setting out in detail performance for 2023-24 and proposed targets for 2024-25. He also referred Members to the various business plan objectives incorporated within the plan, confirming that these had been drafted to take account of the Best Value Action Plan and outcome of the Board self-assessment exercise. After full discussion the Board approved the 2024-25 Business Plan.

## Section 3: Case Matters (edited)

### 3.1 Monthly Case Summary:

Mr Walker confirmed that a total of 21 new applications had been received in May 2024.

3.2-3.3 There were no cases in either of these categories.

### 3.4 Referral press releases issued since last meeting of the Board:

- 10 May 2024 – Zhang Donglin Referral
- 10 May 2024 – Darren Hughes Referral

### 3.5 Requests for extensions of time to submit further representations (edited):

- A four-week extension of time was approved in one case.

3.6 – 3.7 There were no cases in either of these categories.

### 3.8 Discussion Cases (edited)

The Board discussed one group of cases and after discussion agreed various actions.

## Section 4: Proposed Referral Cases

There were no cases in this category.

## Section 5: Proposed Interim Cases (edited)

5.1 – 5.2 The Board considered two statements of reasons. After full discussion it agreed not to refer either case to the High Court.

## Section 6: Proposed Supplementary Cases

There were no cases in this category.

## Section 7: Stage 1 Pre Acceptance Cases (edited)

**7.1 – 7.18** A total of 17 new applications were considered and the following decisions were made:

1 case	Accepted for a review of conviction in respect of one ground only
1 case	Rejected: the applicant had not appealed against conviction or sentence
1 case	Rejected: the grounds of review were a repeat of the grounds of appeal
4 cases	Rejected: in each case there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
1 case	Rejected: it was not in the interests of justice to accept the case for full review
4 cases	Rejected: in each case the applicant had not appealed and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
2 cases	Rejected: in each case the applicant had abandoned their appeal without good reason and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
1 case	Rejected: in respect of conviction there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review; and in respect of sentence, the applicant had not appealed and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
1 case	Rejected: in respect of conviction the applicant had abandoned their appeal without good reason and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review; and in respect of sentence, there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
1 case	Continued: for 1 month in order to take decision

Mr Matthews, Ms Reilly, Ms Fordyce, Miss McMenemy and Mr Young had each left the meeting for the discussion in one case having previously declared conflicts of interest and therefore took no part in their consideration.

## Section 8: Concluding Matters (edited)

### 8.1 Any Other Competent Business (edited)

Mr Reddick reported that one member of the admin team had submitted their resignation and would be finishing with the Commission on 21 June 2024. Mr Matthews asked that the Board's thanks and best wishes be passed onto them.

### 8.2 Date of Next Meeting

- Board Meeting – Tuesday 25 June 2024 @ 10:00
- Audit Committee Meeting – Friday 5 July 2024 @ 10:00

C Reddick  
11 June 2024