

# SCOTTISH CRIMINAL CASES REVIEW COMMISSION

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BOARD ON TUESDAY 25 JUNE 2024

10:00 AM, HYBRID MEETING (OFFICE & VIDEO CONFERENCE)

### FOR DISCLOSURE VIA THE PUBLICATION SCHEME

In line with the Commission's Disclosure policy, various paragraphs may have been edited or deleted from these minutes as the information contained therein relates to specific case information and/or personnel-related matters. Where the summary of discussion has been edited or the names have been deleted, this is indicated at the start of the relevant paragraph or section.

#### **Present:**

Mr Bill Matthews (Chair) – video conference  
Mr Raymond McMenamin – video conference  
Mrs Elaine Noad – office  
Mrs Gillian Mawdsley – office  
Ms Laura Reilly – video conference  
Mrs Suzanne Mertes – office  
Mr Finlay Young – video conference  
Ms Jacqueline Fordyce – video conference

#### **Also Present:**

Mr Chris Reddick, Director of Corporate Services (minutes) – office

### **Section 1: Governance Matters (edited)**

#### **1.1 Apologies**

Doctor Quinn, Miss McMenamin KC and Mr Walker had submitted their apologies.

#### **1.2 Conflicts of Interest/Declarations of Interest/Gifts & Hospitality**

Members were asked to declare any known conflicts of interests or gifts and hospitality.

There were no conflicts of interest or declarations of gifts or hospitality.

#### **1.3 Minutes of Board meeting held on 31 May 2024**

The Board approved the minutes of the Board meeting held on 31 May 2024 subject to minor amendment. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme subject to the same minor amendments.

#### **1.4 Matters Arising**

There were no matters arising.

## **1.5 Minutes of Policy meeting held on 24 May 2024**

The Board approved the minutes of the Policy meeting held on 24 May 2024 subject to minor amendment. The Board also approved the version of the minutes for the Publication Scheme subject to the same minor amendments.

## **1.6 Matters Arising**

There were no matters arising.

## **1.7 Chair's Report**

Mr Matthews provided the Board with an update on the ongoing Board recruitment process.

## **1.8 Chief Executive's Report (edited)**

In Mr Walker's absence, Mr Reddick provided the Board with an update on the following matters:

1.8.1 Mr Reddick confirmed that Mr Walker met with the Crown Agent on 12 June 2024 to discuss a number of matters of mutual interest.

1.8.2 Mr Reddick provided an update on planning for the SCCRC's 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Event including details of proposed speakers.

1.8.3 Mr Reddick confirmed that the new staff desktop rollout had now largely been completed.

## **1.9 Court Decisions**

There were no court decisions.

## **1.10 Correspondence:**

Mr Reddick provided an overview of the following correspondence which had been received:

1.10.1 A formal 2024-25 funding letter had been received from Anna Donald, Deputy Director, Criminal Justice, on 4 June 2024, confirming the Commission's budgetary allocation for the year.

1.10.2 All Chairs and Chief Executives had received a letter from the Minister of Public Finance on 30 May 2024 Public Services Reform. Mr Reddick confirmed that the Commission had already published the required Public Services Reform information on the website covering the period 2023-24.

1.10.3 A letter had been received from the Head of Appeals Unit at COPFS on 18 April 2024 in respect of the recovery of materials from the COPFS archive system.

## Section 2: Management Issues

### 2.1 Notification by Members of non-case related work

Mr Matthews confirmed that he had undertaken work in respect of Board recruitment and appraisals during the month.

### 2.2 Training & Development

The following training and development had been undertaken since the last meeting of the Board:

- Mr Lynn provided Data Protection training to all Commission staff on 12 June 2024.

## Section 3: Case Matters (edited)

### 3.1 Monthly Case Summary:

Mr Reddick confirmed that a total of 18 new applications had been received in June 2024.

3.2-3.6 There were no cases in any of these categories.

### 3.7 Persistent & Repeated Applications

- One applicant was registered on the Persistent & Repeated Applications Register

### 3.8 Discussion Cases

The Board discussed one group of cases.

## Section 4: Proposed Referral Cases

There were no cases in this category.

## Section 5: Proposed Interim Cases (edited)

5.1 The Board considered 1 statement of reasons. After full discussion it agreed not to refer the case to the High Court.

## Section 6: Proposed Supplementary Cases (edited)

6.1-6.2 The Board considered 2 supplementary statement of reasons. After full discussion it finally agreed not to refer the cases to the High Court.

## Section 7: Stage 1 Pre Acceptance Cases (edited)

7.1 – 7.18	A total of 18 new applications were considered and the following decisions were made:	
	3 cases	Accepted for a review of conviction only
	2 cases	Rejected: in each case there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
	2 cases	Rejected: in each case the applicant had not appealed against conviction
	1 case	Rejected: the grounds of review were a repeat of the grounds of appeal
	1 case	Rejected: the applicant had not appealed against conviction and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
	2 cases	Rejected: in each case the applicant had abandoned their appeal without good reason and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
	3 cases	Rejected: in each case the grounds of review were a repeat of the grounds of appeal and there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review
	2 cases	Rejected: in each case there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review and it was not in the interests of justice to accept the cases for full review
	1 case	Rejected: the applicant had not appealed against conviction, there were no plausible or stateable grounds of review and it was not in the interests of justice to accept the case for full review
	1 case	Continued for 1 month

Mrs Mawdsley had left the meeting for the discussion in one case and Ms Reilly in two cases having previously declared conflicts of interest and therefore took no part in their consideration.

## Section 8: Concluding Matters

### 8.1 Any Other Competent Business

There was no other competent business.

### 8.2 Date of Next Meeting

- Board Meeting – Friday 26 July 2024 @ 10:00

C Reddick  
18 July 2024